

#### **Research Article**

# Insecticidal activities of some essential oils against larval ectoparasitoid, *Habrobracon hebetor* (Hymenoptera: Braconidae)

# Jabraeil Razmjou<sup>\*</sup>, Vahid Mahdavi, Hooshang Rafiee-Dastjerdi, Arash Farhoomand and Samira Molapour

Department of Plant Protection, Faculty of Agriculture and Natural Resources, University of Mohaghegh Ardabili, Ardabil, Iran.

Abstract: Habrobracon hebetor Say is an idiobiont and gregarious larval ectoparasitoid of many moths. In this study, lethal and sublethal effects of Eucalyptus camaldulensis, Carum carvi and Heracleum persicum essential oils on the demographic parameters of *H. hebetor* were assessed at  $26 \pm 2$  °C,  $60 \pm 5\%$ RH, and a photoperiod of 16:8 (L: D) h. Essential oils were obtained from these plants by hydro-distillation method using a Clevenger apparatus. The chemical constituents of essential oils were detected by Gas Chromatography-Mass spectrometry (GC-MS). 250ml Glass vials were used for the fumigant toxicity experiments. In order to assess the sublethal effects, adult wasps were exposed to an  $LC_{25}$  of each essential oil and then the demographic parameters of live parasitoid wasps were studied. Fumigant toxicity with adults indicated that the lethal concentration (LC<sub>50</sub>) values of the above essential oils against H. hebetor females were 1.116, 0.34 and 3.416µl/l air, respectively. Chemical analysis by GC-MS displayed o-Cymene (15.11%), Carvone (55.8%) and Hexyl butyrate (41.78%) were main constituents of the essential oils of E. camaldulensis, C. carvi and H. *persicum*, respectively. The results showed that the intrinsic rate of increase (r), finite rate of increase ( $\lambda$ ), net reproductive rate ( $R_0$ ) and gross reproductive rate (GRR) were significantly affected by the essential oils. The highest and the lowest r values were 0.226 and 0.130 day<sup>-1</sup> in control and C. carvi-treated insects, respectively. According to these results, essential oils have suitable potential for the integrated management of stored product pests.

Keywords: Essential oils, fumigant toxicity, GC-MS, parasitoid wasp

# Introduction

Plants may provide potential alternatives to currently used insect-control agents because they constitute a rich source of bioactive chemicals (Wink, 1993). Essential oils are volatile natural complex secondary metabolites characterized by a strong odor and have a generally lower density than that of water (Bakkali *et al.*, 2008). In storedproduct insect pest control, essential oils may have numerous types of effects (Papachristos and Stamopoulos, 2002): they may have a fumigant activity (Lee *et al.*, 2004; Mahdavi *et al.*, 2017), they may act as repellents (Ndungu *et al.*, 1995), they may act as anti-feedants (Huang *et al.*, 1997) or may affect some biological parameters such as growth rate, life span and reproduction (Pascual-Villalobos, 1996). Since these oils are often biodegradable to non-toxic products, and are potentially suitable for use in integrated pest management, knowledge of their composition could lead to the development of new classes of safer insect-control agents (Kim and Ahn, 2001).

Handling Editor: Saeid Moharramipour

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author, e-mail: razmjou@uma.ac.ir Received: 27 December 2017, Accepted: 10 March 2018 Published online: 9 May 2018

It has been suggested that essential oils could be used in conjunction with biological control on the integrated pest management program (González et al., 2013). On the other hand, integrating the application of biocontrol agents and pesticides for pest management requires knowledge about the impact and selectivity of the pesticides, on natural enemies (Croft, 1990). Habrobracon hebetor Say (Hymenoptera: Braconidae) is one of the most important parasitoids of the larval stage of many important agricultural pests such as the Noctuid and Pyralid moths (Baker et al., 1995; Dweck et al., 2008). In 1961, in Varamin, Iran, the *H. hebetor* was first collected by Farahbakhsh (Navaei et al., 2002). In Iran, mass rearing of H. hebetor is done on Mediterranean flour moth, Anagasta kuehniella (Zeller) (Attaran, 1996). Although a high volume of informative literature has been published regarding the effects of essential oils on pest species (Moawed and Ebadah, 2007; Negahban et al., 2007; Ayvaz et al., 2010) little information is available on its effects on parasitoids (González et al., 2013).

Since populations of different insect species respond differently to equal levels of stress (Stark and Banks, 2004), lethal concentrations of pesticides cannot be used to compare the effects of toxicants when the time interval for analysis is more than a few days. In fact, population effects will largely depend on life history traits. It is difficult to measure both lethal and sublethal effects in a meaningful way that scientists and IPM practitioners can understand. Demographic toxicology is usually considered to be an important tool for accurate assessment of global effects of pesticides (Stark and Banks, 2004). The intrinsic rate of increase (r) has been recommended to assess overall effects of pesticides, because it is based on both survivorship and fecundity parameters (Stark and Wennergren, 1995). Limited information is available on the lethal and sublethal effects of essential oils on H. hebetor (Hashemi et al., 2014).

The purpose of this study was to assess the lethal and sublethal effects of *Eucalyptus camaldulensis, Carum carvi* and *Heracleum* 

*persicum* essential oils on the ectoparasitoid *H. hebetor* for determining possible compatibility of these essential oils with *H. hebetor* in IPM programs.

# **Materials and Methods**

## **Insect rearing**

The *H. hebetor* colony was obtained from the Department of Plant Protection, University of Mohaghegh Ardabili, Iran. The parasitoid wasps were reared on fifth-instar larvae of *A. kuehniella* at  $26 \pm 2$  °C,  $60 \pm 5\%$  relative humidity (RH) and under a photoperiod of 16:8 (L: D) h. Honey, smeared on a strip of paper, was provided to the adults as a food source.

# Plant materials and extraction of essential oils

*C. carvi* was purchased from local market of Ardabil city. *E. camaldulensis* and *H. persicum* were collected from Sari and Meshkin-Shahr cities, respectively. Essential oil was extracted from the plant samples using a Clevenger-type apparatus where the plant material is subjected to hydro-distillation. Conditions of extraction were 50g of samples, 1: 10 plant material/water volume ratio, and a three-hour distillation. The oil was dehydrated with anhydrous sodium sulphate (10min). Extracted oil was stored in a refrigerator at 4 °C.

## Analysis of essential oils

The oil composition was analyzed by gas chromatography-mass spectrometry (GC-/MS; Agilent, 7890 B series, USA). Identification of the spectra was carried out by studying their patterns of fragmentation and also their coincidence with the standard spectra present in the library of the instrument.

# **Fumigant toxicity**

Bioassay trials were carried out following Negahban *et al.*, (2007) technique. The fumigant toxicity of *C. carvi, E. camaldulensis* and *H. persicum* essential oils on *H. hebetor* female adult stage were tested in glass vials (250mL) in which 20 young females (< 24h old) were released. Filter paper disks (Whatman

No. 1) were cut into 2-cm diameter pieces and fixed under the glass vial screw caps. Filter papers were impregnated with a series of concentrations of each essential oil. Four replicates were run for each concentration and for the control groups. Numbers of dead and live insects were also counted after 24 h from the start of exposure. The control did not show any mortality. The result of each trial was tested for curve fit using PROC GENMOD procedures (Robertson et al., 2007; SAS Institute, 2002), and the data were analyzed using PROC PROBIT (SAS Institute, 2002) in order to determine lethal concentrations (LC<sub>25</sub>, LC<sub>50</sub>, and LC<sub>90</sub> values) with associated 95% fiducial limits.

#### Sublethal effects

To determine the life table parameters of H. hebetor after exposure to sublethal concentrations of essential oils, mated young females (< 24h old) were exposed to an LC25 concentration of essential oils (0.92µl/l air for E. camaldulensis, 0.2µl/l air for C. carvi and 2.788µl/l air for H. persicum). Directly after 24 h exposure period, 25 randomly selected live females were transferred individually to plastic Petri dishes (60 mm in diameter) and then paired with a young male (< 24h old) to ensure sufficient mating during their life span. The wasps were provided with honey as food. The survival and fecundity of each female were recorded daily. Seven fifth instar host larvae were supplied daily for oviposition. Parasitized larvae were kept at the rearing conditions described above. The total number of eggs, hatched number of eggs and the sex of the emerged wasps at adulthood were recorded. Daily schedules of mortality and fecundity were integrated into a life table format (Carey, 1993) and used to calculate net reproductive rate  $(R_0)$ , mean generation time (T), intrinsic rate of increase (r), and finite rate of increase  $(\lambda)$  values. Statistical analysis of the life table parameters was performed using the SAS software (SAS Institute, 2002). Total egg, egg hatch rate, offspring sex ratio [female/(male + female)] and longevity data were analyzed by ANOVA with mean separation at a 5% level of significance by Tukey test.

# Results

# Chemical constituents of essential oil

The chemical constituents of the essential oil of E. camaldulensis, the retention indices and the percentage of the individual components are summarized in Table 1. Thirty-one components were identified representing 92.73% of the total detected constituents. o-Cymene (15.11%), Spathulenol (14.73%), Cryptone (9.23%) and Terpinene-4-ol (7.08%) were the major constituents of the essential oil. Also, Chemical analysis of the essential oil of C. carvi revealed 15 components (98.61%) in which Carvone (55.8%) and Limonene (29.17%) were the major constituents (Table 2). 22 compounds were identified in the essential oil of H. persicum representing 96.99% of the total essential oil, with Hexyl butyrate (41.78%) and Octyl acetate (27.83%) as the major constituents (Table 3).

**Table 1** Chemical composition of essential oil of Eucalyptus camaldulensis.

$a$ -Pinene9391.48Sabinene9754.49 $\beta$ -Pinene9791.91 $\beta$ -Myrcene9910.41 $a$ -Phellandrene10033.18 $a$ -Terpinene10170.69 $o$ -Cymene102615.11 $a$ -Terpinolene10890.38Linalool10973.19 $\beta$ -Thujone11140.31Terpineol11342.11Terpinene-4-ol11777.08Cryptone11869.23Myrtenol11961.14Verbenone12050.11Trans-Carveol12170.24Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14100.48Trans-Carveolyllene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14193.91Aromadendrene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21			~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~
Sabinene9754.49 $\beta$ -Pinene9791.91 $\beta$ -Myrcene9910.41 $\alpha$ -Phellandrene10033.18 $\alpha$ -Terpinene10170.69 $o$ -Cymene102615.11 $\alpha$ -Terpinolene10890.38Linalool10973.19 $\beta$ -Thujone11140.31Terpineol11342.11Terpinene-4-ol11777.08Cryptone11869.23Myrtenol11961.14Verbenone12050.11Trans-Carveol12170.24Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14100.48Trans-Carveol14193.91Aromadendrene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21	Compound	RI	Content (%)
β-Pinene9791.91β-Myrcene9910.41α-Phellandrene10033.18α-Terpinene10170.69ο-Cymene102615.11α-Terpinolene10890.38Linalool10973.19β-Thujone11140.31Terpineol11342.11Terpinene-4-ol11777.08Cryptone11869.23Myrtenol11961.14Verbenone12050.11Trans-Carveol12170.24Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14100.48Trans-Carveolyllene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14193.91Aromadendrene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89Δ-Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21	α-Pinene	939	1.48
β-Myrcene9910.41α-Phellandrene10033.18α-Terpinene10170.69ο-Cymene102615.11α-Terpinolene10890.38Linalool10973.19β-Thujone11140.31Terpineol11342.11Terpinene-4-ol11777.08Cryptone11869.23Myrtenol11961.14Verbenone12050.11Trans-Carveol12170.24Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14091.58α-Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14193.91Aromadendrene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89Δ-Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21	Sabinene	975	4.49
$a$ -Phellandrene10033.18 $a$ -Terpinene10170.69 $o$ -Cymene102615.11 $a$ -Terpinolene10890.38Linalool10973.19 $\beta$ -Thujone11140.31Terpineol11342.11Terpinene-4-ol11777.08Cryptone11869.23Myrtenol11961.14Verbenone12050.11Trans-Carveol12170.24Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14091.58 $\alpha$ -Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Carveol12170.31Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.668Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21		979	1.91
$a$ -Phellandrene10033.18 $a$ -Terpinene10170.69 $o$ -Cymene102615.11 $a$ -Terpinolene10890.38Linalool10973.19 $\beta$ -Thujone11140.31Terpineol11342.11Terpinene-4-ol11777.08Cryptone11869.23Myrtenol11961.14Verbenone12050.11Trans-Carveol12170.24Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14091.58 $\alpha$ -Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Carveol12170.31Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21	β-Myrcene		0.41
o-Cymene102615.11 $\alpha$ -Terpinolene10890.38Linalool10973.19 $\beta$ -Thujone11140.31Terpineol11342.11Terpinene-4-ol11777.08Cryptone11869.23Myrtenol11961.14Verbenone12050.11Trans-Carveol12170.24Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13240.69 $\alpha$ -Copaene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14193.91Aromadendrene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21	α-Phellandrene	1003	3.18
o-Cymene102615.11 $\alpha$ -Terpinolene10890.38Linalool10973.19 $\beta$ -Thujone11140.31Terpineol11342.11Terpinene-4-ol11777.08Cryptone11869.23Myrtenol11961.14Verbenone12050.11Trans-Carveol12170.24Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13240.69 $\alpha$ -Copaene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14193.91Aromadendrene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21	α-Terpinene	1017	0.69
$\alpha$ -Terpinolene10890.38Linalool10973.19 $\beta$ -Thujone11140.31Terpineol11342.11Terpinene-4-ol11777.08Cryptone11869.23Myrtenol11961.14Verbenone12050.11Trans-Carveol12170.24Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14091.58 $\alpha$ -Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14193.91Aromadendrene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.668Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21	o-Cymene	1026	15.11
$\beta$ -Thujone11140.31Terpineol11342.11Terpinene-4-ol11777.08Cryptone11869.23Myrtenol11961.14Verbenone12050.11Trans-Carveol12170.24Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13240.69 $\alpha$ -Copaene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14091.58 $\alpha$ -Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14193.91Aromadendrene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21	α-Terpinolene	1089	0.38
Terpineol11342.11Terpinene-4-ol11777.08Cryptone11869.23Myrtenol11961.14Verbenone12050.11Trans-Carveol12170.24Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13240.69 $\alpha$ -Copaene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14091.58 $\alpha$ -Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21	Linalool	1097	3.19
Terpineol11342.11Terpinene-4-ol11777.08Cryptone11869.23Myrtenol11961.14Verbenone12050.11Trans-Carveol12170.24Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13240.69 $\alpha$ -Copaene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14091.58 $\alpha$ -Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21	β-Thujone	1114	0.31
Terpinene-4-ol11777.08Cryptone11869.23Myrtenol11961.14Verbenone12050.11Trans-Carveol12170.24Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13240.69 $\alpha$ -Copaene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14091.58 $\alpha$ -Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21	Terpineol	1134	2.11
Cryptone11869.23Myrtenol11961.14Verbenone12050.11Trans-Carveol12170.24Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13240.69 $\alpha$ -Copaene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14091.58 $\alpha$ -Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21		1177	7.08
Myrtenol11961.14Verbenone12050.11Trans-Carveol12170.24Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13240.69 $\alpha$ -Copaene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14091.58 $\alpha$ -Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21		1186	9.23
Trans-Carveol12170.24Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13240.69 $\alpha$ -Copaene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14091.58 $\alpha$ -Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14193.91Aromadendrene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21		1196	1.14
Cuminaldehyde12424.16Phellandral12512.17Carvacrol12992.18Bicyclo elemene13240.69 $\alpha$ -Copaene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14091.58 $\alpha$ -Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14193.91Aromadendrene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21	Verbenone	1205	0.11
Phellandral $1251$ $2.17$ Carvacrol $1299$ $2.18$ Bicyclo elemene $1324$ $0.69$ $\alpha$ -Copaene $1377$ $0.49$ Cis-Caryophyllene $1409$ $1.58$ $\alpha$ -Gurjunene $1410$ $0.48$ Trans-Caryophyllene $1419$ $3.91$ Aromadendrene $1439$ $3.11$ Germacrene D $1485$ $0.38$ Bicyclogermacrene $1500$ $1.89$ $\Delta$ -Cadinene $1523$ $0.68$ Spathulenol $1578$ $14.73$ Isospathulenol $1621$ $3.21$	Trans-Carveol	1217	0.24
Phellandral $1251$ $2.17$ Carvacrol $1299$ $2.18$ Bicyclo elemene $1324$ $0.69$ $\alpha$ -Copaene $1377$ $0.49$ Cis-Caryophyllene $1409$ $1.58$ $\alpha$ -Gurjunene $1410$ $0.48$ Trans-Caryophyllene $1419$ $3.91$ Aromadendrene $1439$ $3.11$ Germacrene D $1485$ $0.38$ Bicyclogermacrene $1500$ $1.89$ $\Delta$ -Cadinene $1523$ $0.68$ Spathulenol $1578$ $14.73$ Isospathulenol $1621$ $3.21$	Cuminaldehyde	1242	4.16
Bicyclo elemene13240.69 $\alpha$ -Copaene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14091.58 $\alpha$ -Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14193.91Aromadendrene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21		1251	2.17
$\alpha$ -Copaene13770.49Cis-Caryophyllene14091.58 $\alpha$ -Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14193.91Aromadendrene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21	Carvacrol	1299	2.18
Cis-Caryophyllene14091.58 $\alpha$ -Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14193.91Aromadendrene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21	Bicyclo elemene	1324	0.69
Cis-Caryophyllene14091.58 $\alpha$ -Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14193.91Aromadendrene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21	α-Copaene	1377	0.49
$\alpha$ -Gurjunene14100.48Trans-Caryophyllene14193.91Aromadendrene14393.11Germacrene D14850.38Bicyclogermacrene15001.89 $\Delta$ -Cadinene15230.68Spathulenol157814.73Isospathulenol16213.21		1409	1.58
Trans-Caryophyllene $1419$ $3.91$ Aromadendrene $1439$ $3.11$ Germacrene D $1485$ $0.38$ Bicyclogermacrene $1500$ $1.89$ $\Delta$ -Cadinene $1523$ $0.68$ Spathulenol $1578$ $14.73$ Isospathulenol $1621$ $3.21$		1410	0.48
Aromadendrene $1439$ $3.11$ Germacrene D $1485$ $0.38$ Bicyclogermacrene $1500$ $1.89$ $\Delta$ -Cadinene $1523$ $0.68$ Spathulenol $1578$ $14.73$ Isospathulenol $1621$ $3.21$	Trans-Caryophyllene	1419	3.91
Bicyclogermacrene         1500         1.89           Δ-Cadinene         1523         0.68           Spathulenol         1578         14.73           Isospathulenol         1621         3.21		1439	3.11
Δ-Cadinene         1523         0.68           Spathulenol         1578         14.73           Isospathulenol         1621         3.21	Germacrene D	1485	0.38
Δ-Cadinene         1523         0.68           Spathulenol         1578         14.73           Isospathulenol         1621         3.21	Bicyclogermacrene	1500	1.89
Isospathulenol 1621 3.21	Δ-Čadinene	1523	0.68
Isospathulenol 1621 3.21	Spathulenol	1578	14.73
γ-Eudesmol 1632 2.01		1621	3.21
	γ-Eudesmol	1632	2.01

<sup>1</sup> Retention index.

Compound	$RI^1$	Content (%)
α-Pinene	939	1.07
β-Pinene	979	0.02
β-Myrcene	991	2.01
Limonene	1029	29.17
γ-Terpinene	1060	0.32
α-Terpinolene	1089	0.3
Linalool	1097	0.88
Trans limonene oxide	1159	2.81
Trans carveol	1217	0.41
Cuminaldehyde	1242	0.09
Carvone	1243	55.8
Carvacrol	1299	0.34
β-Caryophyllene	1441	0.51
Germacrene D	1485	1.87
Spathulenol	1578	3.01

 Table 2 Chemical composition of essential oil of Carum carvi.

<sup>1</sup> Retention index.

**Table 3** Chemical composition of essential oil of *Heracleum persicum*.

Compound	$RI^1$	Content (%)
Propyl butyrate	939	0.9
Ethyl(2E)-pentenoate	941	0.6
Butyl isobutyrate	975	0.9
Butyl butyrate	986	0.7
Isobutyl isovalerate	988	0.4
Hexyl acetate	992	1.1
Octanal	998	0.8
Buthyl-2-methylbutyrate	1024	1.2
ρ-Cymene	1025	2.7
Isoamyl butyrate	1027	0.7
γ-Terpinene	1060	3.2
Isoamyl,2-methyl-butyrate	1087	0.4
Linalool	1097	0.5
Hexyl isobutyrate	1132	4.3
Hexyl butyrate	1179	41.78
Hexyl-2-methylbutyrate	1182	2.3
Decanal	1186	0.9
Octyl acetate	1199	27.83
Octyl butyrate	1230	1.1
(E)-Anethol	1261	0.5
Hexyl hexanoate	1368	2.08
Octyl-2-methylbutyrate	1373	2.1

<sup>1</sup> Retention index.

#### Fumigant toxicity

The LC<sub>25</sub>, LC<sub>50</sub> and LC<sub>90</sub>, 95% fiducial limits, slope and Chi-square ( $\chi^2$ ) of different tested essential oils against female parasitoid wasp are shown in Table 4. Probit analysis showed that  $LC_{50}$  values of these essential oils against *H. hebetor* were 1.116, 0.34 and 3.416 µl/l air for *E. camaldulensis, C. carvi* and *H. persicum*, respectively. The toxicity of essential oils on *H. hebetor* female adults was different, as inferred by the confidence intervals of  $LC_{50}$ .

#### Sublethal effects

The number of eggs laid by H. hebetor was significantly affected by essential oil treatments in comparison with control (F =99.36; df = 3,99; p < 0.0001) (Table 5). Egg hatch rate was reduced by essential oil treatments. Mean female longevity was significantly affected by essential oil treatments compared with control (F = 68.74; df = 3,99; p < 0.0001) (Table 5). No difference in the sex ratio was found in the offspring of females of H. hebetor that were exposed to the essential oils (F = 1.77; df = 3,99; p = 0.158). The effects of exposure to LC<sub>25</sub> concentration of essential oils on stable population parameters of H. hebetor are shown in Table 6. Computed net reproductive rate  $(R_0)$  and gross reproductive rate (GRR) illustrated that essential oil treatments reduced female population (Table 6). The intrinsic rate of increase (r) was significantly different between control and essential oil treatments (F = 124.69; df = 3,99; p < 0.0001). Our results showed that Carum carvi essential oil and control had the lowest  $(0.130 \text{ day}^{-1})$  and maximum (0.226) $day^{-1}$ ) r values, respectively. The finite rate of increase ( $\lambda$ ) (F = 132.69; df = 3,99; p < 0.0001) was affected by essential oils. The highest and lowest value of finite rate of increase was observed in control (1.25 day<sup>-1</sup>) and *Carum carvi* essential oil (1.14 day<sup>-1</sup>), respectively. The LC<sub>25</sub> of essential oils influenced the mean generation time (T) (F = 72.89; df = 3,99; p < 0.0001) compared to the control (Table 6). The doubling time (DT) was significantly affected by essential oil treatments compared with control (F =61.90; df = 3,99; p < 0.0001).

Essential oils n		n Clana   CE	. 2	Lethal concentrations (µl/l air)			
Essential oils n	11	Slope $\pm$ SE	χ² –	LC <sub>25</sub> (95% FL)	LC <sub>50</sub> (95% FL)	LC <sub>90</sub> (95% FL)	
Eucalyptus camaldulensis	480	$7.65\pm0.93$	2.62 <sup>ns</sup>	0.920 (0.84-0.96)	1.116 (1.072-1.168)	1.644 (1.508-1.876)	
Carum carvi	480	$3.17\pm0.39$	2.85 <sup>ns</sup>	0.200 (0.172-0.236)	0.340 (0.308-0.376)	0.880 (0.720-1.200)	
Heracleum persicum	480	$7.64\pm0.90$	3.2 <sup>ns</sup>	2.788 (2.584-2.94)	3.416 (3.272-3.572)	5.028 (4.624-5.720)	

Table 4 Toxicity of essential oils to adult stage of Habrabracon hebetor.

Lethal concentrations and 95% fiducial limits (FL) were estimated using logistic regression (SAS Institute 2002).

Table 5 The mean of biological parameters of adults *Habrobracon hebetor* exposed to LC<sub>25</sub> of essential oils.

Insecticide	Egg laid	Hatched eggs (%)	longevity (day)	Sex ratio $\frac{1}{2}/(\frac{1}{2}+\frac{3}{2})$
Control	326.76 ± 26.53 a	$89.40 \pm 0.62$ a	29.92 ± 2.101 a	$0.486 \pm 0.021$ a
Heracleum persicum	$87.68 \pm 5.38$ b	$83.64 \pm 1.38 \text{ ab}$	$15.00 \pm 0.678$ b	$0.451 \pm 0.034$ a
Eucalyptus camaldulensis	$53.64 \pm 4.92$ bc	$76.13 \pm 4.79$ bc	$10.52 \pm 0.466$ c	$0.397 \pm 0.043$ a
Carum carvi	$26.88 \pm 2.28$ c	$70.33 \pm 4.61$ c	$8.24 \pm 0.487$ c	$0.366 \pm 0.056$ a

Table 6 The mean of population parameters of Habrobracon hebetor treated with LC25 of essential oils.

Treatment	GRR (offspring)	$R_0$ (offspring)	$r (\mathrm{day}^{-1})$	$\lambda (day^{-1})$	T (day)	DT (day)
Control	$179.324 \pm 0.362a$	$158.346 \pm 0.521a$	$0.226 \pm 0.0001a$	$1.25 \pm 0.0001a$	$22.43 \pm 0.0096a$	$3.07\pm0.001c$
Heracleum persicum	$45.429\pm2.001b$	$42.392\pm2.62b$	$0.174\pm0.0027b$	$1.19\pm0.0032b$	$21.58\pm0.173b$	$3.99\pm0.063b$
Eucalyptus camaldulensis	$28.258 \pm 1.57c$	$24.590\pm2.26c$	$0.16\pm0.0045b$	$1.17\pm0.0053b$	$20.03 \pm 0.211$ c	$4.33\pm0.119b$
Carum carvi	$13.346 \pm 0.739d$	$11.751 \pm 0.954d$	$0.130\pm0.0048c$	$1.14\pm0.0055c$	$18.91 \pm 0.248 \text{ d}$	$5.31 \pm 0.192a$
Means in a column	Means in a column followed by different letters are significantly different. ANOVA with Tukey post hoc test ( $P < 0.05$ ).					

# Discussion

Essential oils are phytochemicals with large insecticidal activities (Lee et al., 2008; Chu et al., 2011). Due to their high volatility under ambient temperatures, they have fumigant activity that might be important for controlling stored-product insect pests (Tripathi et al., 2002; Ayvaz et al., 2010). This study was aimed at assessing lethal and sublethal effects of C. carvi, E. camaldulensis and H. persicum essential oils on H. hebetor female adult stage. Experiments were conducted to determine whether the insecticidal activity of C. carvi, E. camaldulensis and H. persicum essential oils against H. hebetor female adults was attributable to fumigant action. The LC<sub>50</sub> values that were determined in this study indicated that C. carvi essential oil has very high toxicity to adults of *H. hebetor* (LC<sub>50</sub> =  $0.34\mu$ l/l air) (Table 4). Our results showed that essential oils had toxic effects on female adult stage of H. hebetor. There are few studies for toxicity of the essential oils against H. hebetor. For example, the toxicity of Ferula assafoetida essential oil was demonstrated on biological characteristics of Н. hebetor (Hym.: Braconidae) in vitro by Hashemi et al., (2014). González et al., (2013) examined the lethal and sublethal effects of four essential oils on the egg parasitoid Trissolcus basalis and reported that the plant essential oils had a negative effect on the population growth parameters of this parasitoid wasp. The reasons for the insecticidal effects of plant essential oils can be attributed to their chemical compounds. There are reports on insecticidal activity of o-Cymene (Jemâa et al., 2012), Carvone (Ibrahim et al., 2001) and Hexyl butyrate (Comisi et al., 2009).

Several approaches have been utilized to study the effects of pesticides on natural enemies, such as lethal effect, and exposure of

natural enemies to sublethal doses (Desneux et al., 2006). Evaluation of only acute toxicity (lethal effect) only provides a partial assessment of potential effects of pesticides in exposed organisms (Walthall and Stark, 1996) and therefore studying sublethal effects of phytoinsecticides is of primary importance (Desneux et al., 2007) for IPM. Biological parameters such as fecundity, fertility and longevity were significantly and adversely affected by C. carvi essential oil compared to the control treatment. But none of the essential oils had effects on the sex ratio of offspring (Table 5). Demographic toxicology has been considered as a better measure of response to toxicants than individual life history traits (Forbes and Calow, 1999). The use of intrinsic rate of increase (r) has been recommended for evaluating the total effects of phyto-insecticides, because it is based on both survivorship and fecundity (Stark and Wennergren, 1995). In our study, the life table parameters showed significant differences in population growth performance between the treated and untreated females of H. hebetor. The net reproductive rate  $(R_0)$ , the intrinsic rate of increase (r), and the finite rate of increase ( $\lambda$ ) of the treated females were inferior to the control and these were achieved within a shorter mean generation time (T). This in turn resulted in a longer doubling time (DT). Several researchers have reported that life-table parameters of natural enemies were affected by sublethal concentrations of pesticides (essential oils and insecticides) (Mahdavi et al., 2011; Wang et al., 2012; Poorjavad et al., 2014).

The high activity of these compounds could make them a potential substitute for methyl bromide in various uses in stored-product control programs and can be used in coordination with biological agents as a component of the integrated pest management. The observed fumigant activity demonstrates that essential oils are a source of biologically active vapors which may potentially prove to be efficient insecticides. The results showed that *C. carvi* essential oil had more adverse acute and sublethal effects on the ectoparasitoid *H. hebetor*. Our results were based on extended laboratory studies. Based on these laboratory results it seems that *H. persicum* essential oil is potentially more compatible with a chosen IPM approach. After laboratory studies, more attention should be devoted on storage environment experiments to obtain more applicable results under storage conditions.

# Acknowledgments

This work was financially supported by the University of Mohaghegh Ardabili, Ardabil, Iran which is appreciated.

# References

- Attaran, M. R. 1996. Effects of laboratory hosts on biological attributes of parasitoid wasp *Bracon hebetor* Say. [M.Sc. thesis]. Tehran: Tarbiat Modares University. p. 74.
- Ayvaz, A., Sagdic, O., Karaborklu, S. and Ozturk, I. 2010. Insecticidal activity of the essential oils from different plants against three stored-product insects. Journal of Insect Science, 10:21. Available online: http://www.insectscience.org/10/21.
- Baker, J. E., Weaver, D. K., Throne, J. E. and Zettler J. L. 1995. Resistance to protectant insecticides in two field strains of the stored products insect parasitoid, *Bracon hebetor* (Hymenoptera: Braconidae). Journal of Economic Entomology, 88 (3): 512-519.
- Bakkali, F., Averbeck, S., Averbeck, D. and Idaomar, M. 2008. Biological effects of essential oils- A review. Food and Chemical Toxicology, 46: 446-475.
- Carey, J. R. 1993. Applied Demography for Biologists with Special Emphasis on Insects. Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Chu, S. S., Wang, C. F., Du, S. S., Liu, S. L. and Liu, Z. L. 2011. Toxicity of the essential oil of *Illicium difengpi* stem bark and its constituent compounds towards two grain storage insects. Journal of Insect Science, 11:152. Available online: http://www. insectscience.org/11.152.
- Cosimi, S. Rossi, E., Cioni, P. L. and Canale, A. 2009. Bioactivity and qualitative analysis

of some essential oils from Mediterranean plants against stored-product pests: Evaluation of repellency against *Sitophilus zeamais* Motschulsky, *Cryptolestes ferrugineus* (Stephens) and *Tenebrio molitor* (L.). Journal of Stored Products Research, 45: 125-132.

- Croft, B. A. 1990. Arthropod Biological Control Agents and Pesticides. John Wiley and Sons, New York, 723 pp.
- Desneux, D., Ramirez-Romero, R. and Kaiser, L. 2006. Multistep bioassay to predict recolonization potential of emerging parasitoid after a pesticide treatment. Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry, 25: 2675-2682.
- Desneux, N., Decourtye, A. and Delpuech, J. M. 2007. The sublethal effects of pesticides on beneficial arthropods. Annual Review of Entomology, 52: 81-106.
- Dweck, H. K. M., Gadallah, N. S. and Darwish, E. 2008. Structure and sensory equipment of the ovipositor of *Habrobracon hebetor* (Say) (Hymenoptera: Braconidae). Micron, 39 (8): 125-126.
- Forbes, V. E. and Calow, P. 1999. Is the per capita rate of increase a good measurement of population level-effect of in ecotoxicology? Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry, 18: 1544-1556.
- González, J. O. W., Laumann, R. A., da Silveira, S., Miguel, M., Borges, M. C. B. and Ferrero, A. A. 2013. Lethal and sublethal effects of four essential oils on the egg parasitoids *Trissolcus basalis*. Chemosphere, 92: 608-615.
- Hashemi, Ż., Goldansaz, S. H. and Hosseini Naveh, V. 2014. Effects of *Ferula assafoetida* essential oil on biological characteristics of *Habrobracon hebetor* (Hym.: Braconidae) in vitro. 21<sup>th</sup> Congress of Plant Protection. Orumiyeh, Iran.
- Huang, Y., Tan, J. M. W., Kini, R. M. and Ho, S. H. 1997. Toxic and antifeedant action of nutmeg oil against *Tribolium castaneum* (Herbst) and *Sitophilus zeamais* Motsch. Journal of Stored Products Research, 33: 289-298.

- Ibrahim, M. A., Kainulainen, P., Aflatuni, A., Tiilikkata, K. and Holopainen, J. K. 2001. Insecticidal, repellent, antimicrobial activity and phytotoxicity of essential oils: With special reference to limonene and its suitability for control of insect pests. Agricultural and Food Science in Finland, 10: 243-259.
- Jemâa, J. M. B., Haouel, S., Bouaziz, M. and Khouja, M. L. 2012. Seasonal variations in chemical composition and fumigant activity of five *Eucalyptus* essential oils against three moth pests of stored dates in Tunisia. Journal of Stored Products Research, 48: 61-67.
- Kim, D. H. and Ahn, Y. J. 2001. Contact and fumigant activities of constituents of *Foeniculum vulgare* fruit against three coleopteran stored-product insects. Pest Management Science, 57: 301-306.
- Lee, B. H., Annis, P. C., Tumaalii, F. and Choi, W. S. 2004. Fumigant toxicity of essential oils from the Myrtaceae family and 1,8cineole against 3 major stored-grain insects. Journal of Stored Products Research, 40(5): 553-564.
- Lee, E. J., Kim, J. R., Choi, D. R. and Ahn, Y. J. 2008. Toxicity of cassia and cinnamon oil compounds and cinnamaldehyde-related compounds to *Sitophilus oryzae* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae). Journal of Economic Entomology, 101 (6): 1960-1966.
- Mahdavi, V., Rafiee-Dastjerdi, H., Asadi, A., Razmjou, J., Fathi Achachlouei, B. and Kamita, Sh. J. 2017. Effective management of the *Phthorimaea operculella* (Zeller) using PVA nanofibers loaded with *Cinnamomum zeylanicum* essential oil. American Journal of Potato Research, DOI: https://doi.org/10.1007/s12230-017-9603-3.
- Mahdavi, V., Saber, M., Rafiee-Dastjerdi, H. and Mehrvar, A. 2011. Comparative study of the population level effects of carbaryl and abamectin on larval ectoparasitoid *Habrobracon hebetor* Say (Hymenoptera: Braconidae). Biocontrol, 56 (6): 823-830.
- Moawed, S. S. and Ebadah, I. M. A. 2007. Impact of some natural plant oils on some biological aspects of the potato tuber moth, *Phthorimaea*

*operculella* (Zeller) (Lepidoptera; Gelechiidae). Research Journal of Agriculture and Biotechnology Science, 3 (2): 119-123.

- Navaei, A. N., Taghizadeh, M., Javanmoghaddam, H., Oskoo, T. and Attaran, M. R. 2002. Efficiency of parasitoid wasps, *Trichogramma pintoii* and *Habrobracon hebetor* against *Ostrinia nubilalis* and *Helicoverpa* sp. on maize in Moghan. In: Proc. 15<sup>th</sup> Iranian plant protection congress. Razi University of Kermanshah, Iran, 7-11 September, 327 pp.
- Ndungu, M., Lawndale, W., Hassanali, A., Morena, L. and Cabra, C. S. 1995. *Cleome monophylla* essential oil and its constituents as tick (*Rhipicephalus appendiculatus*) and maize weevil (*Sitophilus zeamais*) repellents. Entomologia Experimentalis et Applicata, 76: 217-222.
- Negahban, M., Moharramipour, S. and Sefidkon, F. 2007. Fumigant toxicity of essential oil from *Artemisia sieberi* Besser against three insects. Journal of Stored Products Research, 43: 123-128.
- Papachristos, D. P. and Stamopoulos, D. C. 2002. Repellent, toxic and reproduction inhibitory effect of essential oil vapours on *Acanthoscelides obtectus* (Say) (Coleoptera: Bruchidae). Journal of Stored Products Research, 38: 117-128.
- Pascual-Villalobos, M. J. 1996. Evaluation of insecticidal activity of *Chrysanthemum coronarium* L., plant extracts. Boletin de Sanidad Vegetal Plagas, 22: 411-420.
- Poorjavad, N., Goldansaz, S. H., Dadpour, H. and Khajehali, J. 2014. Effect of *Ferula assafoetida* essential oil on some biological and behavioral traits of *Trichogramma embryophagum* and *T. evanescens*. Biocontrol, 59: 403-413.

- Robertson, J. L., Russell, R. M., Preisler, H. K. and Savin, N. E. 2007. Bioassay with Arthropods. CRC Press, London.
- SAS Institute. 2002. The SAS system for windows. Cary (NC): SAS Institute.
- Stark, J. D. and Wennergren, U. 1995. Can population effects of pesticides be predicted from demographic toxicological studies? Journal of Economic Entomology, 88: 1089-1096.
- Stark, J. D., Banks, J. E. and Acheampong, S. 2004. Estimating susceptibility of biological control agents to pesticides: influence of life history strategies and population structure. Biological Control, 29: 392-398.
- Tripathi, A. K., Prajapati, V., Verma, N., Bahl, J. R., Bansal, R. P., Khanuja, S. P. S. and Kumar, S. 2002. Bioactivities of the leaf essential oil of *Curcuma Longa* (Var. Ch-66) on three species of stored-product beetles (Coleoptera). Journal of Economic Entomology, 95 (1): 183-189.
- Walthall, W. K. and Stark, J. D. 1996. A comparison of acute mortality and population growth rate as endpoints of toxicological effect. Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety, 37: 45-52.
- Wang, D., He, Y., Guo, X. and Luo, Y. 2012. Acute toxicities and sublethal effects of some conventional insecticides on *Trichogramma chilonis* (Hymenoptera: Trichogrammatidae). Journal of Economic Entomology, 105: 1104-1476.
- Wink, M. 1993. Production and application of phytochemicals from an agricultural perspective. In: van Beek, T.A. and Breteler, H. (Eds.), Phytochemistry and Agriculture, 34: 171-213.

# فعالیت حشره کشی تعدادی از اسانسهای گیاهی علیه زنبور پارازیتوئید خارجی لارو Habrobracon hebetor (Hymenoptera: Braconidae)

جبرائیل رزمجو \*، وحید مهدوی، هوشنگ رفیعیدستجردی، آرش فرهومند و سمیرا مولاپور

گروه گیاهپزشکی، دانشکده کشاورزی و منابع طبیعی، دانشگاه محقق اردبیلی، اردبیل، ایران. \* پست الکترونیکی نویسنده مسئول مکاتبه: razmjou@uma.ac.ir دریافت: ۶ دی ۱۳۹۶؛ پذیرش: ۱۹ اسفند ۱۳۹۶

چكيده: Habrobracon hebetor Say، زنبور پارازيتوئيد خارجي ايديوبايونت و اجتماعي تعدادي زيادي از شب پرهها می باشد. در این مطالعه، اثرات کشندگی و زیرکشندگی اسانسهای اکالیپتوس Eucalyptus camaldulensis، زيرهي سياه Carum carvi و گلپر Eucalyptus camaldulensis  $m 9.5 \pm 0$  در طوبت نسبی m H.~hebetor در شرایط  $m 1 \pm 10$  درجه سلسیوس، رطوبت نسبی m H.~hebetorدرصد و دورهی نوری ۱۶ ساعت روشنایی و ۸ ساعت تاریکی مورد ارزیابی قرار گرفت. اسانسهای گیاهی به روش تقطیر با بخار آب با استفاده از دستگاه کلونجر استخراج شدند. ترکیبات شیمیایی اسانسهای گیاهی با استفاده از دستگاه کروماتوگرافی گازی متصل به طیفسنج جرمی (GC-MS) شناسایی شدند. برای انجام آزمایشهای تدخینی از ظروف شیشهای ۲۵۰ میلیلیتری استفاده گردید. بهمنظور ارزیابی اثرات زیرکشندگی، حشرات کامل زنبور در معرض مقادیر LC<sub>25</sub> هر یک از اسانسها قرار داده شدند و سپس پارامترهای دموگرافیک زنبورهای پارازیتوئید زنده مورد مطالعه قرار گرفتند. سمّيت تدخيني نشان داد كه مقادير غلظت كشندهي LC50 اسانسهاي مذكور عليه حشرات كامل مادهی زنبور H. hebetor بهترتیب ۱/۱۱۶، ۳۴/۰ و ۳/۴۱۶ میکرولیتر بر لیتر هوا بودند. تجزیهی شیمیایی اسانس ها با استفاده از GC-MS نشان داد که بهتر تیب o-Cymene به میزان ۱۵/۱۱ درصد، Carvone به میزان ۵۵/۸ درصد و Hexyl butyrate به میزان ۴۱/۷۸ درصد، ترکیبات اصلی اسانسهای اکالیپتوس، زیره ی سیاه و گلپر بودند. نتایج نشان داد که نرخ ذاتی افزایش جمعیت (r)، نرخ متناهی افزایش جمعیت ( $\lambda$ )، نرخ خالص تولیدمثلی ( $R_0$ ) و نرخ ناخالص تولیدمثلی (GRR) زنبور پارازیتوئید، بهطور معنیداری تحت تأثیر اسانسها بودند. بالاترین و پایینترین مقدار r بهترتیب در تیمارهای شاهد (۰/۲۲۶ بر روز) و حشرات تیمار شده با اسانسهای زیرهی سیاه (۰/۱۳۰ بر روز) بودند. مطابق نتایج، اسانسهای گیاهی پتانسیل مناسبی برای مدیریت تلفیقی آفات انباری دارند.

واژگان كليدى: اسانسھاى گياھى، سمّيت تدخينى، GC-MS، زنبور پارازيتوئيد