

Research Article

Efficacy of one botanical and three synthetic insecticides against silverleaf whitefly, *Bemisia tabaci* (Hem.: Aleyrodidae) on cucumber plants in the field

Gholamreza Golmohammadi^{1*}, Ali Hosseinigharalari¹, Mohammadtaghi Fassihi² and Roya Arbabtafti¹

1. Department of Agricultural Entomology Research, Iranian Research Institute of Plant Protection, Tehran, Iran.

2. Agricultural and Resource Natural Research, Bushehr Province.

Abstract: The silverleaf whitefly, Bemisia tabaci (Hem.: Aleyrodidae), is a key pest of greenhouse crops. Nymphs and adults feed on plant sap and excrete honeydew, resulting in reduction of yield and quality. This pest has a high potential for developing resistant biotypes against different insecticides. Therefore, it is necessary to study the efficacy of different categories of insecticides against B. tabaci. In this research, efficacy of imidacloprid (0.5 l/ha), thiacloprid + deltamethrin (0.75 l/ha), pyrethrum (4 l/ha) and thiamethoxam + lambda-cyhalothrin (0.3 and 0.4 l/ha) with four replications were studied in a completely randomized block design in Yazd and Bushehr provinces of Iran. Mean (± SE) efficacy of imidacloprid, thiacloprid + deltamethrin, pyrethrum and thiamethoxam + lambda-cyhalothrin (0.3 and 0.4 1/ha) were 73.42 ± 3.41, 89.57 ± 2.86, 90.29 ± 2.79, 68.13 ± 3.37 and 75.62 ± 3.76% against B. tabaci nymphs 7 days after treatment in Yazd, respectively; while in Bushehr, they were 57.30 \pm 3.37, 68.45 \pm 4.65, 64.17 \pm 2.87, 30.0 \pm 4.56 and 53.0 \pm 3.35%, respectively. Thiacloprid + deltamethrin, pyrethrum and thiamethoxam + lambda-cyhalothrin (at 0.4 l/ha) can be suitable candidates in IPM programs of B. tabaci.

Keywords: Bemisia tabaci, insecticide, efficacy, cucumber

Introduction

The silverleaf whitefly, *Bemisia tabaci* (Hem.: Aleyrodidae), is a key pest of field and greenhouse cucumber. Nymphs and adults feed on plant sap and excrete honeydew. Due to its multi-voltinism and short generation-time, it has high potential for developing biotypes resistant to insecticides. One of the methods to decrease the rate of emergence of resistant

biotypes is application of insecticides with different modes of actions. Therefore, it is necessary to study the efficacy of different types of insecticides against *B. tabaci*. Effective control of *B. tabaci* by new insecticides can decrease the side effects from overusing non-effective insecticides.

Resistance of *B. tabaci* to different types of insecticides has been reported (Ellswortha and Martinez-Carrillo, 2001; Toscano, 2003). Research on efficacy of insecticides against *B. tabaci* goes back to 1986 by Razeghi and Omati (1986), who studied the efficacy of pirimiphosmethyl, dimethoate, dimicron, fenpropathrin and Dimicron + carbaryl. In a field research (Bacci *et al.*, 2007), cartop, imidacloprid and abamectin

Handling Editor: Dr. Aref Marouf

^{*}**Corresponding author**, e-mail: ghgolmohammadi@gmail.com Received: 24 November 2013, Accepted: 25 February 2014 Published online: 8 March 2014

caused 80% mortality; while, fenitrothion, fenthion, phenthoate malathion, bifenthrin, cypermethrin, esfenvalerate and fenpropathrin were not effective, and also caused high mortality on natural enemies. Deltametrin and dimetoat were effective against B. tabaci on faba bean, Vicia faba (Ahmad et al., 2002). Li et al. (2000) reported cross-resistance when they treated В. tabaci with imidacloprid, thiamethoxam and acetamiprid. Application of imidacloprid may increase yield by 20% in addition to an effective control of B. tabaci (Horowitz et al., 1998). Application of acetamiprid or thiamethoxam on 22 consecutive generations of B. tabaci resulted in a 30-50-fold increase in resistance of B. tabaci to these insecticides. However, there was not a crossresistance between these insecticides and IGR compounds (Ishaaya et al., 2003). Treatment of bean seeds with imidacloprid followed by four times of foliage spraying resulted in 83%, 92% and 70% mortalities of eggs, nymphs and adults of B. tabaci, respectively (Barbosa et al., 2002). Imidacloprid, buprofezin and pyriproxyfen were effective against B. tabaci on cotton (Palumbo et al., 2001). Wang et al. (2008) studied the efficacy of abamectin, acetamiprid, azadirachtin, imidacloprid, oxymatrine, chlorpyrifos, cyhalothrin, buprofezin and rotenone against B. tabaci by dipping method. Based on their result, abamectin was the most efficacious followed by acetamiprid, azadirachtin, oxymatrine, imidacloprid, chlorpyrifos, cyhalothrin and rotenone. The efficacy of azadirachtin against B. tabaci was studied by Jazzar and Abou-Fakhr (2003) and Abou-Fakhr and McAuslane (2006).

Anti-feeding, repellency, and insecticidal effects of extracts obtained from different plant Azadirachta indica, species, e.g. Salvia bracteata, Nerium oleander, Lavandula officinalis and Ferula assafoetida have been studied (Marouf et al., 2002; Moharamipour et al., 2003; Mansouri-Jajaiiand Marouf, 2004). Azadirachtin (Neem®) at 20 mg/cm² effectively repelled the red flour beetle (Tribolium castaneum (Col.: Tenebrionidae) (Chander et al., 1999).

The objective of this research was to evaluate the efficacy of four different insecticides against *B. tabaci* in the field. The results can be useful in application of insecticides against *B. tabaci* in IPM programs.

Materials and Methods

This research was conducted on cucumber fields in Yazd (Yazd, Iran) and Dashtestan (Bushehr, Iran) in 2011 in a completely randomized block design with six treatments and four replications. The treatments were: 1) imidacloprid (Confidor[®] SC 35 at 0.5 l/ha, Bayer Crop Science LP, Research Triangle Park, NC), 2) thiacloprid+deltamethrin (Proteus® OD 110. Bayer Crop Science LP) at 0.750 l/ha, 3) pyrethrum (Pyrethrum[®] EC 5 at 4 l/ha, Agropharm Chemical Company, Buckinghamshire, UK), 4 & 5) thiamethoxam + lambda-cyhalothrin (Eforia® SC 247 at 0.4 & 0.3 l/ha, Syngenta Crop Protection, Greensboro, NC), and 6) control (treated with water). The experimental plots were 30 m² and 2 m apart. The blocks were 3 m apart. Since, adult whiteflies were very mobile and might enter into the treated plots, the control plots were located 70 m apart from treated plots. 'Mirsoltan' cucumber variety was planted in the fields. An atomizer sprayer (Model: 102063, Tecnoma Company, France) was calibrated (at 1000 l/ha), before running the experiment. The sprayer was washed with water and detergent before applying each treatment. Samplings were done once before treatment; and 3, 7 and 14 days after treatment. The samples were taken early in the morning, when the weather was cool. In each plot, 10 plants were randomly selected from which one leaf/plant (at the top third of the plant canopy) was excised and transferred to the laboratory inside plastic bags. The number of adult whiteflies under these leaves was recorded. To sample for eggs and nymphs, 10 leaves per plot were removed from different plants and transferred to the laboratory in plastic bags. To record the number of eggs and nymphs On the abaxial surface of leaves, two 1-cm² sampling units were chosen under the leaves, such that the units included the main vein. Counting was done using a stereo-microscope at X40.

The efficacy was estimated based on the Henderson-Tilton formula (Henderson and Tilton, 1955):

Efficacy (%) = $100 \times [1 - (Ta \times Cb)/(Tb \times Ca)]$

where, Ta is the number of insects in treated plot after treatment, Cb is the number of insects in control plot before treatment, Tb is the number of insects in treated plot before treatment, and Ca is the number of insects in control plot after treatment.

Data were analyzed using procedures of SAS[®] (SAS Institute Inc., 2002). The normality of the untransformed and transformed data and also normality of residuals after analysis of variance were checked using stem-leaf and normal probability plots. Homoscedasticity was checked by observing graphical distribution plots of variance by mean (PROC PLOT). A General Linear Model (PROC GLM) was used to compare the efficacy of the treatments as well as the number of insects at different growth stages in the treatments ($\alpha = 0.05$). Comparisons between the treatments were made using the Duncan's test, where analysis of variance showed significant differences among the means.

Results and Discussion

Yazd province: The efficacy against the nymphs and adults at different days after treatment were significantly different among treatments (Nymphs: 3 days after treatment: $F_{4,8}$ = 4.25, P = 0.024; 7 days after treatment: $F_{4,8} =$ 9.17, P = 0.001; 14 days after treatment: $F_{4,8} =$ 6.16, P = 0.001 - Adults: 3 days after treatment: $F_{4,8} = 6.10$, P = 0.001; 7 days after treatment: $F_{4,8} = 3.21$, P = 0.042; 14 days after treatment: $F_{4,8} = 3.58$, P = 0.039). Three days after treatment, only thiacloprid+deltamethrin had an acceptable (i.e. more than 70%) efficacy against the nymphs (Table 1). However, despite significant differences in efficacy of the treatments against the nymphs on the 7th and 14^{th} days after treatment, none of the insecticides controlled the nymphs at an acceptable level. The adults (Table 1) were controlled at acceptable levels on the 3rd and 7th days after treatment (\geq 70%). pyrethrum and thiacloprid+deltamethrin kept their high efficacy (i.e. \geq 90%) against adults up to the 7th day after treatment, and ranked the most efficacious treatments (more than 70% efficacy) on the 14th day after treatment (Table 1). Imidacloprid and both doses of thiamethoxam + lambda-cyhalothrin (0.4 and 0.3 l/ha) resulted in an acceptable level of adult control (ca. 70%) up to the 7th day after treatment.

Bushehr province: The efficacy against the nymphs and adults at different days after treatment were significantly different among treatments (Nymphs: 3 days after treatment: $F_{4,8} =$ 11.99, P = 0.0001; 7 days after treatment: $F_{4.8} =$ 6.08, P = 0.001; 14 days after treatment: $F_{4,8} =$ 5.16, P = 023 - Adults: 3 days after treatment: $F_{4.8}$ = 3.74, P = 0.041; 7 days after treatment: $F_{4,8} =$ 4.86, P = 0.036; 14 days after treatment: notavailable due to technical problems). Three days after treatment, none of the treatments resulted in an acceptable level of control against the nymphs. However, on the 7th day after treatment, the treatments resulted in an acceptable control of nymphs except imidacloprid, which caused 51% mortality (Table 2). Fourteen days after treatment, only thiacloprid + deltamethrin and pyrethrum effectively controlled the nymphs. Despite significantly different efficacies among treatments against the adults, none could effectively control the adults of B. tabaci.

Despite fast acting nature of imidacloprid, its low efficacy in both provinces may indicate the emergence of resistant biotypes. Imidacloprid has been used for quite a long time against sucking insects, which may corroborate the possibility of emergence of resistant biotypes. Previously, resistance of whiteflies to imidacloprid was reported (Sheikhi, 2008). Studies of Bi and Tosccano (2007) on biotypes of whiteflies resistant to imidacloprid, showed biotypes were susceptible to that these insecticides with other modes of action such as chlorinated insecticides (e.g. endosulfan), pyrethroids (e.g. fenpropathrin, deltamethrin), organophosphorus insecticides (e.g. malathion, Chlorpyrifos), and carbamates (e.g. methomyl).

Downloaded from jcp.modares.ac.ir on 2025-07-13]

This may corroborate our results on efficacy of treatments against nymphs.

Study on efficacy of imidacloprid, thiamethoxam and dinotefuran against nymph and adult whiteflies (Pirmoradi *et al.*, 2010) showed that thiamethoxam and imidacloprid were the most and least effective against adults,

respectively. The low efficacy of imidacloprid against adult whiteflies was reported to be due to emergence of resistant biotypes of whiteflies (Pirmoradi *et al.*, 2010). They also reported higher mortality rate in nymphs compared with adults, which confirm our results.

Table 1 Efficacy of different insecticides against nymphs and adults of silverleaf whitefly, *Bemisia tabaci* on cucumbers in the field in Yazd province.

Insecticides	Dose (l/ha)	% efficacy on 1 Days after treat	hymphs (Mean \pm tment ¹	SE)	% efficacy on adults (Mean \pm SE) Days after treatment ¹		
		+ 3	+ 7	+ 14	+ 3	+ 7	+ 14
Imidacloprid	0.50	$26.26 \pm 3.27c$	$38.55 \pm 3.12b$	$27.44 \pm 4.25 ab$	$79.22 \pm 4.65b*$	$73.42 \pm 3.41b$	$60.31 \pm 4.23b$
Thiacloprid + Deltamethrin	0.75	76.81 ± 5.67a	63.85 ± 4.35a	$22.12 \pm 3.75b$	92.34 ± 4.35ab	89.57 ± 2.86a	82.68 ± 4.11a
Pyrethrum	4.00	$42.61 \pm 4.82b$	$65.92 \pm 4.27a$	$4.11 \pm 4.35c$	$95.65 \pm 3.74a$	$90.29 \pm 2.79a$	71.1 ± 3.95ab
Thiamethoxam + Lambda-cyhalothrin	0.40	$50.77 \pm 4.39 b$	$40.05 \pm 3.62b$	11.27 ± 4.31 bc	$81.64 \pm 2.95b$	$75.62 \pm 3.76b$	$32.58 \pm 3.45c$
Thiamethoxam + Lambda-cyhalothrin	0.30	$40.09\pm2.58b$	$33.36 \pm 2.41b$	$40.86 \pm 3.29a$	$75.07 \pm 2.55b$	$68.13 \pm 3.37b$	$31.35 \pm 2.78c$

¹Means followed by the same letters in a column are not significantly different (Duncan's test, $\alpha = 0.05$).

Table 2 Efficacy	of different	insecticides	against	nymph	and	adult	silverleaf	whitefly,	Bemisia	tabaci	on
cucumber in the fiel	d in Bushehi	r province.									

Insecticides	Dose	% efficacy on n	ymphs (Mean ± S	SE)	% efficacy on adults (Mean ± SE) Days after treatment ¹			
	(l/ha)	Days after treat	ment ¹					
		+ 3	+ 7	+ 14	+ 3	+ 7	$+ 14^{2}$	
Imidacloprid	0.50	45.65 ± 2.35a	$51.12 \pm 4.74b$	$50.07 \pm 3.85b$	$53.45 \pm 2.58a$	57.30 ± 3.37 ab	NA	
Thiacloprid +	0.75	$25.0 \pm 2.55b$	$70.0 \pm 4.56a$	$89.40 \pm 6.52a$	55.17 ± 2.21a	$68.45 \pm 4.65a$	NA	
Deltamethrin Pyrethrum	4.00	$21.1 \pm 3.23b$	79.42 ± 3.39a	$72.37 \pm 5.32a$	51.55 ± 3.36a	$64.17 \pm 2.87a$	NA	
Thiamethoxam +	0.40	$49.62 \pm 3.23a$	$84.25 \pm 5.32a$	$53.75\pm4.87b$	$34.10 \pm 2.59b$	$53.0\pm3.35b$	NA	
Lambda-Cyhalothrin Thiamethoxam +	0.30	38.65 ± 4.65a	75.6 ± 4.57a	$60.30 \pm 3.69b$	23.67 ± 3.71c	$30.0 \pm 4.56c$	NA	
Lambda-cyhalothrin								

438

¹ Means followed by the same letters in a column are not significantly different (Duncan's test, $\alpha = 0.05$).

 2 Not-available data due to technical problems.

In our study, pyrethrum resulted in an acceptable level of whitefly control and was more effective than other treatments. Studies of Jazzar and Abou-Fakhr (2003) and Abou-Fakhr and McAuslane (2006) showed effective control of *B. tabaci* with azadirachtin, resulting in 9.4 ± 3.6 nymphs on treated leaves compared to 24.3 ± 7 nymphs on untreated leaves.

Some research on efficacy of plant extracts against insects has also reported high mortality rates of insects treated with these compounds. Ahmad *et al.* (1999) reported 100% mortality rate of adult Pulse beetle, *Callosobruchus chinensisi* (Col.: Bruchidae), 3 days after release on seeds treated with extracts of Sesamex and Neem.

Higher efficacy of treatments against adults in Yazd compared with Bushehr, might be due to genetic difference between the two populations, which needs more research. Higher efficacy of pyrethrum on nymphs, 14 days after treatment, in Yazd compared with Bushehr might be due to difference in weather conditions, resulting in faster degradation of pyrethrum in Yazd. The efficacy of thiacloprid + deltamethrin on nymphs had an increasing trend during the evaluated period in Bushehr, while in Yazd, it had a decreasing trend; more research is needed to clarify this difference.

In conclusion, we recommend application of thiacloprid + deltamethrin and pyrethrum, (at 0.75 and 4 l/ha, respectively) for controlling *B. tabaci* nymphs for up to 7 days after treatment. thiamethoxam + lambda-cyhalothrin at 0.3 l/ha may also be used in rotation with thiacloprid + deltamethrin and pyrethrum.

Acknowledgments

This research was funded by Iranian Research Institute of Plant Protection (Ministry of Jihade-Agriculture of Iran) (Project No.: 04-16-16-89031).

References

Abou-Fakhr Hammad and McAuslane, H. J. 2006. Effect of *Melia azedarach* L. Extract on

Bemisia argentifolii (Hemiptera: Aleyrodidae) and its biocontrol agent *Eretmocerus rui* (Hymenoptera: Aphelinidae). Environmental Entomology, 35 (3):740-745.

- Ahmad, K. S., Iton, T. and Ichikawa, T. 1999.
 Effects of plant oils on oviposition preference and larval survivorship of *Callosoborochus chinensis* (Col.: Bruchidae) on Azuki bean. Applied Entomology and Zoology, 34: 547-550.
- Ahmad, M., Arif, M. I., Ahmad, Z., and Denholm, I. 2002. Cotton whitefly (*Bemisia tabaci*) resistance to organophosphate and pyrethroid insecticides in Pakistan. Pest Management Science, 58: 203-238.
- Bacci, L., Crespo, A. L. B., Galvan, T. L., Pereira, E. J. G., Picanco, M. C., Silva, G. A. and Chediak, M. 2007. Toxicity of insecticides to the sweet potato whitefly (Hemiptera: Aleyrodidae) and its natural enemies. Pest Management Science, 63: 699-706.
- Barbosa, F. R, Siquiera, K. M. M., Souza, E. A., Moreira, W. A., Haji, F. N. P. and Alencar, J. A. 2002. Efeito do controle qu'imico da moscabranca na incid[^]encia do v'irus-do-mosaico-dourado e na produtividade do feijoeiro. Pesqu Agropec Bras, 37:879-883 (Abstract in English).
- Bi, J. L. and Toscano, N. C. 2007. Current status of the greenhouse whitefly, *Trialeurodes vaporariorum*, susceptibility to neonicotinoid and conventional insecticides on strawberries in Southern California. Pest Management Science, 63: 747-752.
- Chander, H., Nogender, A., Ahuja, D. K. and Berry, S. K. 1999. Laboratory evaluation of plant extracts as repellents to the rust red flour beetle, *Tribolium castaneum* (Herbst.) on jute fabrics, International pest control, 41: 18-20.
- Ellswortha, P. C. and Martinez-Carrillo, J. L. 2001. IPM for *Bemisia tabaci*: a case study from North American Crop Protection, 20: 853-869.
- Henderson, C. F. and Tilton, E. W. 1955. Tests with acaricides against the brow wheat mite, Journal of Economic Entomology, 48: 157-161.

- Horowitz, A. R., Mendelson, Z., Weintraub, P.
 G. and Ishaaya, I. 1998. Comparative toxicity of foliar and systemic applications of acetamiprid and imidacloprid against the cotton whitefly, *Bemisia tabaci* (Hemiptera:Aleyrodidae). Bulletin of Entomological Research, 88: 437-442.
- Ishaaya, I., Kontsedalov, S. and Horowitz, A. R. 2003. Novaluron (Rimon), a novel IGR: potency and cross-resistance. Archives of Insect Biochemistry and Physiology, 54: 157-64.
- Jazzar, C. and Abou-Fakhr Hammad, E. 2003. The efficacy of enhanced aqueous extracts of *Melia azedarach* leaves and fruits integrated with the *Camptotylus reuteri* releases against the sweet potato whitefly nymphs. Bulletin of Insectology, 56 (2): 269-275.
- Li, Y., Dennehy, T. J., Li, X. and Wigert, M. E. 2000. Susceptibility of Arizona whiteflies to chloronicotinyl insecticides and IGRs: new developments in the 1999 season. ProcEedings of 2000 Beltwide Cotton Conferences. National Cotton Council, Memphis, TN. pp. 1325-1332.
- Mansouri-Jajaii, Sh. and Marouf, A. 2004. Studying the efficacy of some herbal extracts against *Callosobruchus maculatus* F. Proceedings of 16th Iranian Plant Protection Congress, p. 193.
- Marouf, A., Mosavi, M., Tajbakhsh, M. and Sanjari, S. 2002. Preliminary study on larvicidal and antifeedant effect of *Calotropis procera* extract. Proceedings of 15th Iranian Plant Protection Congress, p. 142.
- Moharamipour, S., Nazemi-Rafi, J., Morovati, M., Talebi, A. A. and Fathipour, Y. 2003.

The efficacy of extracts of *Nerium oleander*, *Lavandula officinalis* and *Ferula assafoetida* on feeding indices of *Tribolium castaneum*. Journal of Entomological Society of Iran, 23: 69-89.

- Palumbo, J. C., Horowitz, A. R. and Prabhaker, N. 2001. Insecticidal control and resistance management for *Bemisia tabaci*. Crop Protection. 20: 739-765.
- Pirmoradi, N. A., Sheikhigarjan, A., Baniameri, V. and Imani, S. 2010. Evaluation of susceptibility of the first instar nymphs and adults of *Trialeurodes vaporariorum* (Hemiptera: Aleyrodidae) to neonicotinoid insecticides under laboratory conditions. Journal of Entomological Society of Iran, 31: 13-24.
- Razeghi, M. and F. Omati 1986. Bioecological study of Silver whitefly on eggplant and finding an IPM solution. Project report of BandarAbbas (Iran). Plant Pests and Diseases Research Laboratory, 25 pp.
- SAS, Institute 2002. The SAS system for windows. SAS Institute, Cary, N. C. Sheikhi, A. 2008. Studying the efficacy of new insecticides against *Trialurodes* vaporariorun and Bemesia tabaci. Iranian Research Institute of Plant Protection Research Report, 34 p.
- Toscano, N. C. 2003. Perspectives on insecticide resistance in *Bemisia tabaci*. 3rd International *Bemisia* Workshop Barcelona, 17-20 March.
- Wang, S. Q., Guo, Y. L., Pang, S. T. and Shi, Z. H. 2008. Toxicities of different pesticides to B biotype *Bemisia tabaci*. Acta Agriculturae Zhejiangensis. 20: 367-371.

مطالعه کارایی چند حشره کش سنتتیک و یک حشره کش گیاهی علیه سفیدبالک Bemisia tabaci (Hem.: Aleyrodidae) روی خیار در مزرعه

غلامرضا گلمحمدی'*، علی حسینی قرالری'، محمدتقی فصیحی ٗ و رویا ارباب تفتی'

۱- بخش تحقیقات حشرهشناسی کشاورزی، مؤسسه تحقیقات گیاهپزشکی کشور.
 ۲- مرکز تحقیقات کشاورزی و منابع طبیعی بوشهر.
 * پست الکترونیکی نویسنده مسئول مکاتبه: ghgolmohammadi@gmail.com
 دریافت: ۳ آذر ۱۳۹۲؛ پذیرش: ۶ اسفند ۱۳۹۲

واژگان کلیدی: Bimisia tabaci، حشره کشها، کارایی و خیار